Resident/Graduate Student Selection: The Process

by Dr. James Fine, Columbia University
Professor of Clinical Dental Medicine and Associate Dean for Postdoctoral Programs in the College of Dental Medicine
Number of Applications and First Year Enrollment for Advanced Dental Education Programs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Program</th>
<th>Number of Programs</th>
<th>Applications</th>
<th>Enrollment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>All General Dentistry</td>
<td>299</td>
<td>1,912</td>
<td>17,491</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pediatric Dentistry</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>436</td>
<td>10,663</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oral &amp; Maxillofacial Surgery</td>
<td>101</td>
<td>254</td>
<td>10,656</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Orthodontics</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>363</td>
<td>10,275</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Endodontics</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>221</td>
<td>3,358</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Periodontics</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>185</td>
<td>2,215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prosthodontics</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>153</td>
<td>2,153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dental Public Health</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>168</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oral &amp; Maxillofacial Radiology</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>155</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oral &amp; Maxillofacial Pathology</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>178</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Graphic Based on ADEA Snapshot of Dental Education
Source: American Dental Association, Health Policy Institute, 2013-14 Survey of Advanced Dental Education
The applicant pool

- Is there enough depth and breath
- Creating the pool
- National and international recruitment
- Competition with other specialties
The Admissions Committee

• The committee should be diverse
• Not just diverse in gender (male and female balance) but different academic rank and focus
• Equal vote for each member not giving weight to Chair of Division or program director
• Typically at Columbia we will have at least six members
Resident input

• May or may not have a vote
• Provide feedback to committee
• We will have students from each year eat lunch with all the candidates
• They will give a short presentation on the type of clinical cases and experiences they have
• They will answer any questions
• We do not prep the students
• Any student can join in
Competition between programs

• Branding your program
• The focus of your program
• Certificate, Master of Science, PhD
Does the candidate need to fit the program?

Do you take the candidate that is the overall strongest or one that reflects your program?

We look for the strongest candidate.

So the mix in the class will vary year to year.

Some years more research oriented or international ...
Evaluation of the Application

- Do you interview every applicant?
- Your historic yield for your program is tracked
- We interview on average 20 applicants for five to six resident positions (screened by two faculty)
- On average 45 to 50 completed applications
- Online application service (Apply Yourself)
- Moving to Pass with ADAT
Limit the number of interviews

• Try to interview only five to six on a day
• Only one to two interview days per week
• Try to finish in three to four weeks
• Do not want to exhaust the committee that the interview is not consistent between candidates
• The first two weeks have our highest ranked candidates setup for interviews (based on application we ranked into four groups)
Morning huddle with the candidates

• The program director meets with all the candidates together to go over the process
• Explain that we do not interview every applicant so if they are here they can perform in our program
• It is up to them to show us why they should be selected
Lunch time group meeting with candidates

• We tell them what we look for in a candidate
• What are goals are for our program
• Students from our program are left with the candidates to candidly answer their questions
• Give a presentation of the type of procedures they are taught and discuss their research opportunities
Committee members

• Usually interview one on one or in pairs for faculty not use to the process
• No group interviews of students
• No interview panel of faculty
• No longer then fifteen minutes per interview (total interview time per candidate is hour and half)
Interview questions

• We do not ask academic or technical questions about periodontics or implant dentistry
• We want to see how the candidate conducts themselves and their communication skills
• Academic assessment was already made based on application
How did they select our program?

• Did they get guidance in applying to our program?
• How many places did they apply to?
• We never want the candidate that tells us they applied to our program only!
• Is just about the implant???
Score cards for each candidate

• Each interviewer assigns a score of one to five
• The score is a composite for four areas: maturity, communication skills, desire for the periodontics and personality
• Five being the highest
• The average from the six interviewers is calculated and the candidates ranked.
• There is a debriefing at end of the day for each interview session, but no decision made
Guiding principles

• We will be living with the candidate for thirty six months
• We will spend more waking hours with them then our own family members
• Compatibility with the returning residents in the program
• Self starter
• Ability to function with residents in the other programs
Final conference

• No final decisions are made until all the candidates have been interviewed
• Each candidate is reviewed and differences in scoring being faculty is discussed
• Candidates are ranked one to twenty again
• Top six contacted at appropriate time
They have not interviewed since dental school

- We prepare our predoctoral students for applying to graduate school
- The program directors meet with third and fourth year students to discuss the process of applying to residencies and graduate school
- They address what each discipline looks for in a candidate
- How to prepare for the interview and gone over
We can help each other

• Only a small number of students apply to periodontics from each of the sixty five dental schools
• We should make ourselves available to those students that aspire for a career in periodontics
• Help to focus their selection to the programs that are the best fit
Helping the students

• Discuss their understanding of the specialty and commitment to the three or more years of training
• Reach out to each other on behalf of the candidates that we believe will succeed at other institutions
• Prepare them for the interview process
The changing market place

• Everything is searchable: our school, faculty and research
• Facebook and blog sites allow students to post information about our programs
• The candidates know more about us then we know about them
Competing or cooperating?

• The candidate pool will most likely to contract
• Financial changes in the global market place may start to have an impact
• If a student truly desires to be a periodontist and has the qualifications we should help them
• The new ADAT test, how do we prepare our students and how do we utilize the scores?
Thank You

• Your Thoughts
• jbf1@cumc.columbia.edu